NEW YORK STATE

LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT

PUBLIC MEETING PRISONER COUNT AND REALLOCATION

Tuesday, January 10, 2012

Room 124

State Capitol Building

Albany, New York

1:30 P.M.

TASK FORCE MEMBERS PRESENT:

SENATOR MICHAEL F. NOZZOLIO, Co-Chair

ASSEMBLY MEMBER JOHN J. MCENENY, Co-Chair

SENATOR MARTIN M. DILAN

ASSEMBLY MEMBER ROBERT OAKS

DEBRA LEVINE

ROMAN HEDGES

WELQUIS LOPEZ

LEWIS HOPPE

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

INDEX

SENATOR MICHAEL F NOZZOLIO	Page 4
SENATOR MARTIN M. DILAN	4
ASSEMBLY MEMBER JOHN J. MCENENY	5
ROMAN HEDGES	15
ASSEMBLY MEMBER ROBERT OAKS	26

1 Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 2 (The public meeting commenced at 1:30 p.m.) 3 SENATOR MICHAEL F. NOZZOLIO, CO-CHAIR, NEW YORK STATE LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC 4 5 RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT: ...on demographics and apportionment will come to order. My name is Mike 6 7 I am honored to be the co-chair of the LATFOR 8 Task Force along with my good friend Assemblyman Jack 9 McEneny. Assemblyman, Happy New Year, very good to be 10 with you as always. 11 ASSEMBLY MEMBER JOHN J. MCENENY, CO-CHAIR, 12 NEW YORK STATE LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC 13 RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT: Yes, indeed. 14 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Before I turn it over to 15 you I just want to mention the Senate members of the 16 task force, those with Senate appointments, my-to my 17 right is my colleague Assemblyman Martin, excuse me, 18 Senator Martin Dilan. Good afternoon Senator. 19 SENATOR MARTIN M. DILAN, NEW YORK STATE 2.0 LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH AND 21 REAPPORTIONMENT: Hello. 22 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Good to see you and the 23 citizen representative on the task force Welquis Ray 24 Lopez. Assemblyman. 2.5 ASSEMBY MEMBER MCENENY: Everybody's 26 familiar with who's who and how the progress has been,

6

7

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

been, been, coming along. I will introduce my

members. I'm Jack McEneny from the, from the,

assembly and this is Bob Oaks who is my classmate and

the—I suppose the equivalent of the ranking minority

member here and our citizen representative is Dr.

Roman Hedges.

26

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: It—the group assembled here today has been virtually constantly with each other over the past six months. We have conducted hearings in every corner of New York State, some in the room here have participated in those hearings. Over 55 hours of testimony, well over 375 people submitting oral testimony, and a number of individuals, citizens of this state, submitting written testimony, which is welcome and that it is an extensive record. Today's agenda will be to have ain fact, an imprimatur of this committee on the prison adjustment data release of the 2010 census. That on August 11, 2010, Chapter 57 of the laws of 2010 was signed into law by then Governor Patterson. This measure directed that the New York State Department of Corrections provide this task force with information regarding incarcerated individuals under its jurisdiction as of April 1st, 2010. was the date of the census conducted by the United

23

24

2.5

26

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 States Census Bureau. The objective of the statute was to adjust this census for the very first time for state redistricting purposes by removing prisoners from where they were incarcerated, which is the process that the United States Census undergoes, and placing them at the residence prior-at their residence prior to their incarceration. The adjusted process took three stages and I wish to articulate those. It was first subtracting prisoners from their place of incarceration. Secondly, adding them by a reallocation process that placed them with data from the census taken by the intake of the Department of Corrections responding to the question of where do you live and where your nearest relatives live, and then a process of producing data files and reports. For that I wish to thank the staff of the LATFOR task They have been working tirelessly. I also want to thank Roman Hedges, a member of this task force, who engaged in establishing some of the templates that this first process was to engage in.

This process, by adjusting the numbers of all prisoners at the State and Federal level, the addition of prisoners whose addresses were generated successfully, and then the production of those data files, using the adjusted data. Those criteria have

10

11

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

been a method established by the LATFOR task force

staff and the adjusted data is now on the LATFOR

website. We wish to thank the efforts of those who

went about and did the aggressive processes

necessary, again, for the very first time to

implement this law. I hasten to add there were no

regulations that accompany this law, no procedures,

really no guidance in terms of the protocols to

establish this law so we were at the very first

impression.

Assemblyman McEneny and I have talked about it a number of occasions that certainly more guidance is necessary and more guidance particularly to the Department of Corrections. That our position on thecertainly-on the Senate side of the aisle and, I believe certainly in the assembly's side of the aisle both, we came to the conclusion together that we wanted to count as many as we possibly could achieve in that count to insure that there would not be those left who were not counted, although the statute has been very inadequate in the proper direction of where that counting is, is, to be placed. So the purpose of the task force meeting is to approve the inclusion of this information and that we want the public to have it. It is on the website now but this meeting

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12
again is to insure that, that, it meets with the approval of the members of the task force.

2.1

2.5

ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I think that, that, covers it Senator. I think one of the biggest of problems that arose from the counting of prisoners, which those of you that have been following this right along, it was a commitment emphasized as far back as July that we intended to follow the law as close as we could to the spirit of the law, but that the problem was the letter of the law became confusing because, as the Senator mentioned, there were no accompanying regulations. Therefore, it fell to LATFOR to create the equivalent as such, such, regulations and the final numbers 46,003 of our prisoners are now counted on the home block and in some case within the home town of the community whence they came and where most of them will ultimately return.

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: That the LATFOR website address is latfor.state.ny.us. That information certainly is welcome to the public. With that, shall we entertain a motion?

[crosstalk]

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Can we make the motion and then discuss it?

[crosstalk]

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

1415

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

د ک

24

2.5

26

ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I would like to make a motion we accept the numbers as presented by the combined staff of LATFOR for the purpose of counting for redistricting in accordance with the law.

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: The motion is seconded, made and seconded. Senator Dilan.

SENATOR DILAN: Thank you very much Mr. I, I, first would just like to comment and first also commend you both co-chairpersons and the staff for actually putting out this database. I think this is something that we have all been trying to achieve so I really want to commend you on that. However, I believe two weeks ago I sent both co-chairs a memo requesting that when we do ratify the work and efforts of the staff, that maybe we have a two-week period where the public and advocates and those who have already submitted a plan so LATFOR would have the ability to amend their submission based on the - data and I have not received a response from either co-chair up to this point so I would like to know that once we ratify this today are we giving the public and advocate groups who have been very involved in this process the ability to submit revised or amended plans?

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Senator Dilan, thank you

23

24

25

26

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 and thank you for your comments and thank you for your interest in this issue from the beginning. There is no static or finite date to-sell-by date, on the plans submitted. There is always the opportunity until the final plans are ratified or accepted or enacted by the legislature and signed into law that LATFOR, I think, welcomes the continued input of individuals and organizations. So your comments were well taken. There should be a time period for plans are, are, utilized, but I think certainly if we accept this today, the 10th of January, there is ample time for anyone to be able to modify their plans, at least through the remainder of this month and frankly into the hearing process. I think that is a, a, seque into some of the comments that we would like to talk about that—Do you want to address this directly, Senator?

ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I would observe that I would think some of the groups who have submitted plans already have these numbers. I think they presumed they would be ratified by LATFOR officially as is happening hopefully today and they're probably already adjusting to see if it has any major effect on recommended plans. Some for just one or two districts, others for the entire state, and—

[crosstalk]

1	Page II Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12
2	ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: -for example is
3	the entire state-
4	SENATOR DILAN: [Interposing] So I take it
5	your answer is no, that they do not-
6	ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: [Interposing] My
7	answer is they are probably already doing it—
8	SENATOR DILAN: [Interposing] Two weeks—
9	ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: —they certainly
10	can do it before the public hearings commence.
11	SENATOR DILAN: I take the response as your
12	answer is no. However, I would also-
13	SENATOR NOZZOLIO: No, no, my answer is
14	that, no Senator, my answer is that these—any
15	submissions can be amended at any time throughout now
16	and the hearing process, which again I think there is
17	a segue.
18	We should now, at least, this is an
19	opportune time to discuss the intentions of the task
20	force, those 14 hearings that we engaged in were only
21	meant to be the first round of hearings that the task
22	force will conduct that we-that we'll have at least 8
23	or 9 hearings scheduled across the state and various
24	regions of the state for a second round of hearings to
25	commence sometime, we hope, although we don't have an

exact date now, sometime hopefully, commence by the

26

1	Page 12 Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12
2	end of the month, end of January. And those meetings
3	certainly would also have as has taken place in I
4	believe in 1992 certainly in 2002 will follow the same
5	basic process engaged in, in, those two redistricting
6	cycles where initial plans were put forward from the
7	task force prior to the beginning of the hearings that
8	will take place hopefully beginning the end of
9	January, this month, and grinding into the month of
10	February. I hope that is a further elaboration of
11	your concern and that certainly anyone can submit a
12	plan today, amend it tomorrow, and decide to amend it
13	three or four times between now and the end the
14	process.
15	SENATOR DILAN: I understand what you're
16	saying. I just wanted to have clear and definitely
17	where the public would know that they had the
18	opportunity.
19	MALE VOICE 1: Uh huh.
20	SENATOR DILAN: Then secondly, after—I am
21	supporting this motion. However, I would like to also
22	have the ability to discuss other business here.
23	MALE VOICE 1: Uh huh.
24	SENATOR DILAN: Today after we are done with
25	this?

MALE VOICE 1: Sure.

26

1	Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12
2	SENATOR DILAN: Ok, thank you.
3	ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Maybe we should
4	bring this to a vote too?
5	MALE VOICE 1: Yes.
6	MALE VOICE 2: Yes.
7	SENATOR NOZZOLIO: There is motion on the
8	floor that has been seconded. All those in favor
9	MALE VOICE 3: I
10	MALE VOICE 4: I
11	MALE VOICE 5: I
12	SENATOR NOZZOLIO: The proposal carries
13	unanimously those numbers that are certified on the-
14	that are placed on the LATFOR website have been agreed
15	to and certified by the actions of this motion.
16	MR. ROMAN HEDGES, NEW YORK STATE LEGISLATIVE
17	TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH AND
18	REAPPORTIONMENT: I would just like to add a couple of
19	observations, if I might. The, the, staff did a
20	fantastic job and they really need to be commended. I
21	am reluctant to name individuals because I'll forget
22	someone, but a lot of people helped in a lot of
23	different ways and did really good work and I think
24	that if I look back on the product that I helped
25	produce to try to get this process started, we've got
26	a much better product now than we had then and I think

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 that it's because of the comments and questions and pushing that the staff did to make sure that the product was a much better one.

The second is to really reiterate what you said about what we're faced with going forward. I, I, would certainly hope that the public that has not yet submitted plans will still feel free to do that and I would hope that groups that have already submitted plans will be able to rethink in light of what's happened in the release of this data and as we go forward through the hearing process we're all going to learn things and I'm expecting that we're all going to learn things and change our mind about things as we go forward so I want to really reinforce what the Senator's premise was, which is this is not a finished product, this is the beginning of a process to make it so that everyone can participate and so that we can learn some things.

SENATOR DILAN: I, I, agree with everything you said and I think the staff did a fantastic job and I even believe that the final product is better than I expected so I commend everyone on that. So if we could move on-

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: [Interposing] Before we do, on this, if I may interrupt, Senator, on this

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2.5

26

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 issue, on the prisoner count issue, again I want to reiterate my thanks to the citizen participant in this—on this task force Roman Hedges, for your efforts, Roman, in helping in terms of helping the staff focus on this issue as—

I wear another hat in the legislature and that is chairman of the New York State Standing Committee on Crime Victims, Crime, and Corrections and as such, for many years, have had jurisdiction over the corrections department and the entire correctional system in this state. I can say that it certainly was not ever anticipated as the corrections department takes intake of inmates and have had some of that intake as old as three decades or more, that that intake has just not been the type of intake necessary to do the census taking that this law requires a virtual census department to be placed within the Department of Corrections. That's more staff, more cost, in order to do this correctly, then you would have to have that type of total rethinking on the protocols that are already in place for taking prisoner intake information.

And there are going to have to be training, just as the United States Census takers of which co-chair Assemblyman McEneny is an alumni of that

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 organization. That the census taking process is something that was very unfamiliar to the Department of Corrections and expecting them to have the types of information, people ask well why is it taking so long to do this, why is it taking so—why is it so laborious. It's that way because the Department of Corrections was never given that type of planning and I think that may take legislation and I know Assemblyman McEneny and I have discussed the possibility of recommending that legislation to themake this process one that is readily established. With that, any other comments?

SENATOR DILAN: Yes, I would like to discuss an issue which I believe that I have been bringing before this committee which I believe started at the very, very first hearing that we held. First of all, at that time, I requested that this task force come up with a transparent criteria that the public and advocates could use and be guided by when they make their submissions. I think during the 14 hearings there were several individuals that testified with respect to the size of the Senate, some advocating for 63, but a lot more testifying that the Senate should remain at 62 as the constitution of the State of New York requires in the 1894 formula. I want to know how

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

last Friday at 5:00 p.m. in a very obscure spot of the LATFOR Senate website a new policy memo appears without the ratification of this panel. I want to know how that happens and who authorized that. I would like to know if that attorney is a staff member of LATFOR or is he an outside consultant.

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Senator Dilan, you're referring to a memo from an attorney named Michael Carbon who has been retained by this task force as—he was retained by this task force in 2002 and in 1992 and it's my understanding that Attorney Carbon placed a memo after analyzing the tenets of the New York State constitution and of which it was his responsibility as counsel to this task force to—that that report or analysis, if you will, just as he made an analysis in 2002, was placed on the task force in the same protocols that were established 10 years ago.

Now, it's not a subject of—certainly everyone is entitled to their opinion and I think that those who testified, some of which are former Senate Democrat staff members, during the course of the hearing, who indicated as they were legally disclosed, they were former staff members of the Senate Minority, that they indicated in their testimony that they believe the size of the Senate should be a certain

23

24

2.5

26

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 It's my understanding that the attorney for number. this task force placed-in placing his memo on the LATFOR website and analyzed those submissions and dealt with them in his memorandum. His recommendation is based on his analysis of the New York State constitution. A constitution that derives a formula. That constitution says that the assembly is fixed at 150. It also derives a formula that the Senate is established through population growth and population analysis and that analysis was done. It was done by the attorney and that analysis was placed for the public to review on the LATFOR website. Whether it was 5:00 or—at night or 5:00 in the morning, it was placed on the website when it was completed and that analysis is for everyone to review. They'll have ample opportunity to review that analysis prior to the beginnings of our second round of hearings. that certainly those that are interested will have the opportunity to review that memo, to make their comments known in the additional round of hearings that we are going to be conducting beginning at the end of this month.

SENATOR DILAN: Yeah, we can belabor this for quite a while here today. I didn't know that an outside-retained attorney has the ability on his own

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 1 2 to place something on our website without our approval 3 so before we will conclude today, I would like to make 4 a motion that any policy changes needs to be approved 5 by this panel in public before it's done so I'm going to make that as a form of a motion. Also, as a member 6 7 of this task force, I will be asking the Attorney General of the State of New York to review that memo 8 9 and I will be asking for an Attorney General opinion 10 based on that memo. 11 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: It is certainly within 12 your rights to ask for anything, we should also know 13 that memos to the contrary were placed on our website 14 through the testimony of Mr. Brightbard, who I believe 15 testified at least twice, probably three or four 16 times, and I know the Senate Democrats also had some 17 surrogates for Mr. Brightbard who, when he could not 18 be at a hearing, someone else testified. I remember 19 answering-asking some of those attorneys questions. 20 Their testimony is on the website as well. 2.1 How do you define this motion-22 SENATOR DILAN: [Interposing] I would like 23 to ask you a question-24 [crosstalk] 2.5 SENATOR DILAN: -I would just like to

comment in response to that-

26

	Page 20
1	Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12
2	SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Senator, I am still
3	talking-
4	SENATOR DILAN: [Interposing] You also have
5	your surrogates—
6	SENATOR NOZZOLIO: $-$ I still have the floor,
7	Senator-
8	SENATOR DILAN: [Interposing] You also have
9	your census of every single county by way of-
10	SENTOR NOZZOLIO: —I am surprised you
11	interrupt me while I still have the floor, Senator.
12	SENATOR DILAN: Go ahead.
13	SENTOR NOZZOLIO: I am very surprised at
14	that. I know you don't do that often, but I'm not
15	going to allow it in this case. I had yet not yielded
16	and I guess, in conclusion of my remarks, as a
17	question to you. What do you define as a policy
18	change and how can that be defined within the
19	ramifications of this task force?
20	SENATOR DILAN: Well, I know that when we
21	started these proceedings, I have commented I believe
22	at every single public hearing that the public has the
23	right to know if we're going to drawing these lines
24	based on 62 or any other number, and I never got an
25	answer to that question from anyone on this panel.
26	You keep referring to Mr. Brightbard, who was a former

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 1 2 staff person, and he was a former staff person before 3 I got to the Senate, which is about 10 years ago which 4 he has not worked here, but also you referred to other 5 surrogates that we may have had testify, I know none of those individuals. Mr. Brightbard never worked for 6 7 He was never here while I was a state Senator. 8 But I do want to include in the record that your 9 conference had many surrogates via, via, law firms and 10 people who really had no idea or interest of the 11 redistricting process. They were all basically 12 verbatim, had the same testimony at every single 13 district and county throughout the state. 14 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Senator-15 SENATOR DILAN: And their testimony is also 16 on the website. 17 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Senator, please address 18 the question. You have a motion before the committee. 19 SENATOR DILAN: Ok 20 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: And the question, there 2.1 is no second to that motion. I respectfully asked you 22 what do you define as policy change. 23 SENATOR DILAN: A policy change is that your 24 legal counsel since 2002 has a memo on our website and 2.5 on Friday of last week, just as your leader announces 26 that the Senate will increase by one seat, which I

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

2.5

26

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

believe you made the comment Tuesday of last week. Friday you had a policy change with his new memo where he use-you have a result-you have the result you know you want 63 then he uses inconsistent methods of using four counties. You use one method which was the way he advocated for over 10 years on the website and then the other two counties uses the reverse so you can get the end result and how does your legal counsel, without coming to the public or before this panel, like Mr. Brightbard, and like every single other surrogate who came before this panel, this was done in the darkness of night. It did not appear before the public and there it is, a new memo.

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: So, I take it that there is a motion on the floor, it has not been seconded. With that there will be no vote on it. And I would be glad to discuss these policy issues with you that I think that the Senator Majority leader was asked a question and that he provided a very candid answer to that he knew that there was an issue under review, that is issue has been under review for months by the counsel as brought forth by Mr. Brightbard's analysis, and that certainly can be reviewed on our website, both Mr. Brightbard's analysis and the counsel's analysis of that hearing. Any-someone else.

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

22

23

24

2.5

26

ASSEMBLY MEMBER ROBERT OAKS, NEW YORK STATE LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT: Just to the, the, co-chairs, I guess I would just add and, as Senator Dilan has, has, raised the question, I did not second it although I see some reasons for putting that out as a motion, I quess my concern is if we create that and we always have to have meeting before something goes on the website, I'm not sure that we can keep information flowing in the way that is needed perhaps. From my perspective, I would suggest though that perhaps when things of substance are added to the website, perhaps notification of the members of this task force would at least perhaps allow review and keeping information flowing. So I would just offer that as a thought as we move forward.

SENATOR DILAN: I would just like to make a final comment. You know, I'm really surprised that you did not second it. The majority is in both houses will totally ignore me and you and many of the citizens of the State of New York and as we can see what the outcome is going to be here is the same as it has been for over 50 years and technically I believe that the hearings that we held preliminary are a farce and waste of time and money.

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

24

2.5

26

ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Senator, I would take except to that. My minority member is a classmate. We get along very well. I try to keep him informed of things and will be doing so more intensely. I did not second your amendment because I am not sure what the legal definition of policy is. Policy could be all kinds of things and it could tie up a process which we're trying to accelerate because of the federal court coming out we hope in a short time giving us a-an almost unworkable primary date and to interject a bureaucracy and perhaps the figurative monk squall of—is that a policy issue or not a policy issue on something that just popped up today, it just didn't look like something that I could second or support. What's policy? I think there's probably 30 different opinions here in this room, all from people of good will. I think that's a pretty sweeping structural change and I worry where it would go where it would be passed ever to be passed as a resolution. SENATOR DILAN: I would just like to say

SENATOR DILAN: I would just like to say thank you. It is business as usual. Thank you.

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Any other comments that made before this commission—committee? With that, Assemblyman.

ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: One comment that

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12 our goal is still to start public hearings before the end of the month, but those of you who are looking for maps, it has been long been the custom that no less than seven days notice would be given and with that notice would be the maps. It is our goal, we haven't arrived at the exact schedule yet because we do not want people planning for some date that might be changed, but things are moving swiftly. We have—hope to have those maps out at least seven days prior to the first hearing.

SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Thank you very much.

(The public hearing concluded at 2:00 p.m.)

Prisoner Count and Reallocation, 1-10-12

<u>C E R T I F I</u> C A T E

I, Zola K. Dickerson, do hereby certify that the foregoing typewritten transcription, consisting of pages number 1 to 30, inclusive, is a true record prepared by me and completed from materials provided to me.

Zola K. Dickerson,

Transcriptionist

January 16, 2012